

City of Sacramento

Legislation Text

File #: 2018-01070, Version: 1

Title:

Ordinance listing 3330 McKinley Boulevard (Iva Gard Shepard Garden and Arts Center), 2801 Franklin Boulevard (Gunther's Ice Cream), 720 9th Street (Sacramento County Courthouse) and 4701 Freeport Boulevard (Chase Bank) as Individual Landmarks on the Sacramento Register of Historic and Cultural Resources (M18-011) [Passed for Publication on 11/13/2018; Published 11/16/2018; Noticed 11/16/2018]

File ID: 2018-01070

Location: Districts 3, 4, and 5.

Recommendation:

Conduct a public hearing and upon conclusion: 1) pass a Motion determining that listing of 3330 McKinley Boulevard, 2801 Franklin Boulevard, 720 9th Street, and 4701 Freeport Boulevard as landmarks on the Sacramento Register of Historical and Cultural Resources exempt from review under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15308, which includes actions taken to assure the maintenance, restoration, enhancement, or protection of the environment; and 2) adopt an Ordinance listing 3330 McKinley Boulevard, 2801 Franklin Boulevard, 720 9th Street, and 4701 Freeport Boulevard as landmarks on the Sacramento Register of Historical and Cultural Resources.

Contact: Carson Anderson, Preservation Director, (916) 808-8259, Community Development Department

Presenters: Sean de Courcy, Associate Preservation Planner, (916) 808-2796, Community Development Department

Attachments:

- 1-Description/Analysis
- 2-Ordinance
- 3-Exhibit A
- 4-Historic Resource Evaluation Forms
- 5-Public Comments

Description/Analysis

Issue Detail: In 2016-2017, the City of Sacramento received a Certified Local Government grant from the U.S. Department of the Interior to prepare an historic context statement and conduct a city-wide reconnaissance-level survey of Mid-century historic resources. Part of that survey involved more detailed property-specific research on four excellent examples of the Mid-Century architectural period. These properties were documented using the requisite forms for preparing nominations to the Sacramento Register of Historic and Cultural Resources (Sacramento register). These properties include 3330 McKinley Boulevard, 2801 Franklin Boulevard, 720 9th Street, and 4701 Freeport Boulevard.

Policy Considerations: The City has an interest in maintaining the relevance and integrity of the Sacramento Register and ensuring that properties listed on the Register meet the criteria for listing specified in City Code sections 17.604.210 and 17.604.220. To this end, City Code directs the Preservation Director, to “make preliminary determinations relative to properties’ eligibility for listing on the Sacramento [R]egister” and to “initiate proceedings to nominate resources for listing on the Sacramento register” (Pursuant to City Code sections 17.604.100.C.2 and 17.604.220.).

The nomination of 3330 McKinley Boulevard, 2801 Franklin Boulevard, 720 9th Street, and 4701 Freeport Boulevard for listing as individual landmarks on the Sacramento Register is consistent with Sacramento 2035 General Plan goal HCR 2.1, which provides for the identification and preservation of historical and cultural resources. General Plan policy HCR 2.1.1 states, “The City shall identify historic and cultural resources, including individual properties, districts, and sites, to ensure adequate protection.”

Economic Impacts: Not applicable.

Environmental Considerations: The listing of 3330 McKinley Boulevard, 2801 Franklin Boulevard, 720 9th Street, and 4701 Freeport Boulevard as individual landmarks on the Sacramento Register is exempt from review under the California Environmental Quality Act pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15308. Section 15308 exempts from review acts that are undertaken to assure the maintenance, restoration, enhancement, or protection of the environment where the regulatory process involves procedures for protection of the environment. Listing the four properties as individual landmarks will ensure that future development on these parcels will undergo preservation review, as part of the city’s site plan and design review process, prior to the granting of any entitlements.

Sustainability: Not applicable.

Commission/Committee Action: On September 29, 2017, the Preservation Director reviewed the findings of GEI Consultants, Inc. (Attachment 2) and made a preliminary determination the properties were eligible for listing on the Sacramento Register as landmarks pursuant to City Code section 17.604.210, subsection A(1-2). On October 4, 2018 the City of Sacramento’s Preservation Director, in

conformance with Section 17.604.220 of the City Code, held a public hearing and concurred with the statement of nomination and forwarded the proposed ordinance (Attachment 1), which officially nominated the subject properties as individual city landmarks. On October 17, 2018 the Preservation Commission unanimously recommended city pass an ordinance listing the nominated properties on the Sacramento register.

Rationale for Recommendation: Listing of 3330 McKinley Boulevard, 2801 Franklin Boulevard, 720 9th Street, and 4701 Freeport Boulevard as individual landmarks on the Sacramento Register is consistent with the Historic Preservation Chapter (17.604) of the City Code and the goals of the 2035 General Plan. Furthermore, listing the nominated properties on the Sacramento Register will help ensure their preservation and encourage their rehabilitation consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

Listing an individual landmark on the Sacramento Register requires the resource to meet the requirements of City Code section 17.604.210, subsection A.1 which states:

- A. Listing on the Sacramento register-Landmarks. A nominated resource shall be listed on the Sacramento register as a landmark if the city council finds, after holding a hearing required by this chapter, that all the requirements set forth below are satisfied:
 - a. The nominated resource meets one or more of the following criteria:
 - i. It is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of the history of the city, the region, the state or the nation;
 - ii. It is associated with the lives of persons significant in the city's past;
 - iii. It embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction;
 - iv. It represents the work of an important creative individual or master;
 - v. It possesses high artistic values; or
 - vi. It has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in the prehistory or history of the city, the region, the state or the nation;
 - b. The nominated resource has integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship and association. Integrity shall be judged with reference to the criterion or criteria specified in subsection A.1.a of this section;
 - c. The nominated resource has significant historic or architectural worth, and its designation as a landmark is reasonable, appropriate and necessary to promote, protect and further the goals and purposes of this chapter.

3330 McKinley Boulevard, Iva Gard Shepard Garden & Art Center: The Iva Gard Shepard Garden & Arts Center meets the criteria for listing on the Sacramento register. Specifically, after considering the criteria laid out 17.604.210.A.2, the building satisfies the historical significance criteria for listing within City Code section 17.604.210.A.1.i and 17.604.210.A.1.iii, and

17.604.210.A.210.iii for its association with important post-World War II development patterns in recreation, entertainment and as a locally important example of Mid-century Modern architecture. Staff has concluded the resource retains sufficient historic integrity required for listing pursuant to City Code section 17.604.210.A.1.b. Finally, the nominated resource has significant architectural worth, and its designation as a landmark is reasonable, appropriate and necessary to promote, protect and further the goals and purposes of the Historic Preservation chapter of the City code, as required by section 17.604.210.A.1.c.

The building is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of the history of the city, the region, the state or the nation (17.604.210.A.1.a.i)

The Iva Gard Shepard Garden & Arts Center reflects broad post-World War II development patterns of recreation and entertainment in Sacramento. The Center was a response to the need for a larger venue to host the Sacramento Garden Club, which by the mid-to-late 1950s had grown to include 34 separate clubs and no longer fit into the service shed by the Rose Garden. As such, the building is emblematic of community engagement and growth in recreation activities during the mid-1900s. The nominated resource is located within the 32-acre McKinley Park, a large urban park whose development in the 20th century was influenced by the City Beautiful Movement, a national trend toward civic improvement through beautification that extended into the early 1900s. McKinley Park was established in the 1870s and has always been home to recreational spaces, such as a baseball field, picnic grounds, a zoo, and the Rose Garden, established in 1940. On August 3, 2018, the State Historic Resources Commission recommended to the Keeper of the National Register that McKinley Park was eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places and listed the park on the California Register of Historical Resources.

The building embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction (17.604.210.A.1.a.iii)

The Iva Gard Shepard Garden & Arts Center, in post-and-beam style, is a locally important example of Mid-century Modern architecture in Sacramento and was designed by notable Sacramento architect Raymond R. Franceschi. Mid-century Modern architecture is a more expressive style of modernism that contrasts with the earlier International style. The post-and-beam style is characterized by prominently displayed structural components, expressed through dramatic rooflines, clean and bold lines, wide overhanging eaves, recessed entryways, expanses of glass, and integration with the surrounding landscape due in part to “openness” in the design and use of glass and natural materials on both the interior and exterior of the building. The nominated resource is therefore an important example of an architectural phase in the evolution of Modernism. The Iva Gard building has exposed beams visible on the exterior and interior, dramatic butterfly and shed rooflines, and wide overhanging eaves with recessed entryways. A variety of natural and manufactured materials are present on the exterior and the interior of the building, standing in contrast to the sterility and simplicity of International-style modernist architecture which utilized

mainly glass and concrete. The building also illustrates the outdoor/indoor emphasis that characterized Mid-century Modern architecture through its integration with the surrounding landscape, expressed through two exterior spaces (the patio and Evans Garden Courtyard).

The nominated resource has integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship and association. Integrity shall be judged with reference to the particular criterion or criteria specified in subsection A.1.a of this section (17.604.210.A.1.b)

The Iva Gard Shepard Garden & Art Center remains in its original location in the northeast corner of McKinley Park. The building retains most of the original design; exterior changes have been limited to the wording on the original sign in the 1970s (to reflect the addition of “Iva Gard Shepard” to the building’s name, which was originally the “Sacramento Garden & Art Center”). The exterior materials, architectural features, and design details from the original design, in addition to the original configuration of interior spaces, are intact. Integrity of workmanship remains: the craft of the expressive post-and-beam modernist style is evident in the materials, design details, and structural character of the building. The building also has integrity of feeling and association, retaining all the essential physical features of its original conception and continuing to host activities for a variety of horticultural groups within McKinley Park - thus preserving its original significance through its physical characteristics and use. Therefore, the resource retains sufficient integrity to convey its historic and architectural significance.

The nominated resource has significant historic or architectural worth, and its designation as a landmark is reasonable, appropriate and necessary to promote, protect and further the goals and purposes of this chapter. (17.604.210.A.1.c)

The Iva Gard Shepard Garden & Art Center has significant historic and architectural worth as an example of Mid-century Modernist architecture and an illustration of wider development trends within the city of Sacramento as discussed above. Its designation as a landmark would serve to enhance the cultural and aesthetic standing and identity of McKinley Park and East Sacramento.

2801 Franklin Boulevard, Gunther’s Quality Ice Cream Company: Gunther’s Quality Ice Cream Company meets the criteria for listing on the Sacramento register. Specifically, the building satisfies the historical significance criteria for listing within City Code section 17.604.210.A.1.a.i and 17.604.210.A.1.a.iii. Staff has concluded the resource retains sufficient historic integrity required for listing pursuant to City Code section 17.604.210.A.1.b. Finally, the nominated resource has significant architectural worth, and its designation as a landmark is reasonable, appropriate and necessary to promote, protect and further the goals and purposes of the Historic Preservation chapter of the City code, as required by section 17.604.210.A.1.c.

The building is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of the history of the city, the region, the state or the nation (17.604.210.A.1.a.i)

The Gunther's Quality Ice Cream building (2801 Franklin Boulevard) is associated with historic themes of architecture and commerce in Sacramento. Its eye-catching architecture relates to larger patterns of development such as the post-World War II expansion of automobiles and the explosion of creativity that surfaced after the war-induced austerity had ended - the futuristic and whimsical architectural features such as the wide eaves, curtain wall windows, and neon sign, were meant to be eye-catching and draw-in customers from the road. The building's function harkens back to the national obsession with ice cream in the 1940s, a result of the machine age and the increased capability of machines to more efficiently produce quality ice cream.

The building embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction (17.604.210.A.1.a.iii)

Gunther's Ice Cream building is representative of the transitional period in Mid-century Modernist architecture in the post-World War II period - it exhibits characteristics of both the modest Streamline Moderne architectural style of the 1930s and the exuberant "Googie" architectural style of the 1950s. It was designed by notable Sacramento architectural firm Koblik + Fisher. Its architectural features are characterized by exuberant and creative details meant to attract the attention of passing pedestrians and motorists, including the animated neon sign. The animated neon sign meets Criteria iii individually as a distinctive example of commercial signage and neon technology, which developed nationally during the 1930s but was in decline by the 1950s. Neon signage was a product of the machine age and the technological advances in the early decades of the 20th century. Other notable features are the irregular L-shaped floor plan, the flat roof with overhanging eaves, and the plate glass storefront. Interior features include terrazzo tile floors, subway tile wainscoting, suspended lights and a tiled service window bay window originally used for distributing frozen custard directly to customers from the manufacturing room and now used for viewing the ice cream manufacturing process.

The nominated resource has integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship and association. Integrity shall be judged with reference to the particular criterion or criteria specified in subsection A.1.a of this section (17.604.210.A.1.b)

Since its construction in 1949, Gunther's Ice Cream has undergone minor alterations, including a concrete block garage at the east end in 1982, a stone veneer on the exterior in 1984, and exterior restrooms on the south elevation in 2013. Modifications to the primary façade, including the addition of the "Brady Rock" stone veneer have resulted in diminished integrity of design and workmanship, but overall the integrity remains moderately high. The non-historical additions do not detract from the design details that convey the building's architectural significance: they are located on the rear of the building and are nearly indiscernible from the corner of Franklin Boulevard and 3rd Avenue, from which the key structural features such as the flat roofline with wide overhanging eaves, folded roof details, tilted plate glass storefront, and animated neon sign are visible. The interior has undergone some updates over time but generally retains its original spatial arrangement. Gunther's Ice Cream

retains integrity of location, association and feeling. It remains in its original location, and still hosts its original use. Its setting is satisfactorily intact: the building is located in the periphery of a residential area near homes and other businesses. Its location between Franklin Boulevard, 3rd Avenue, and 30th Street makes it easily accessible and visible by both drivers and pedestrians, a feature important in its original design.

The nominated resource has significant historic or architectural worth, and its designation as a landmark is reasonable, appropriate and necessary to promote, protect and further the goals and purposes of this chapter. (17.604.210.A.1.c)

Gunther's Ice Cream has significant historic and architectural worth as an example of transitional Mid-century Modern architecture in a style emblematic of the machine age and post-World War II growth in commercial development. Its designation as a landmark would enhance the cultural and aesthetic standing, identity, and livability of the area.

720 9th Street, Sacramento County Courthouse: The Sacramento County Courthouse meets the criteria for listing on the Sacramento register. Specifically, the building satisfies the historical significance criteria for listing within City Code section 17.604.210.A.1.a.iii. Staff has concluded the resource retains sufficient historic integrity required for listing pursuant to City Code section 17.604.210.A.1.b. Finally, the nominated resource has significant architectural worth, and its designation as a landmark is reasonable, appropriate and necessary to promote, protect and further the goals and purposes of the Historic Preservation chapter of the City code, as required by section 17.604.210.A.1.c.

The building embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction (17.604.210.A.1.a.iii)

The Sacramento County Courthouse, dating to 1965, is an important and early example in Sacramento of the Brutalist style of Mid-century Modern architecture while also exhibiting International Style and a number of New Formalist elements. The Brutalist style features large concrete masses in block or sculptural form that are left unpolished to convey honesty and texture, flat roofs, rectilinear form, and windows located in voids. The New Formalist elements are expressed in the carefully organized hierarchy of space set upon a raised platform, use of black granite veneer cladding (first floor), the sunscreen/exterior window grill patterning across all four facades, and the implied symmetry and monumental presence those combined elements convey. The County Courthouse was designed by the notable architectural firm Starks, Jozens & Nacht. The first floor of the six-story building is concrete clad with black granite veneer, floors two through five are concrete and feature rectangular, pre-cast concrete panels that function as solar louvers to control sunlight, and the sixth floor is recessed and constructed with steel. Brick pavers run along the base of the building on all four facades. The lack of ornamentation on the building reflects the concept of “form follows function”, a tenet of modernism, dictating that the architecture, particularly of public buildings,

should be utilitarian and reflect the public-service use of the building. The property represents the collaborative design development of the entire property through the work of master architects and landscape architects, as well as artists.

The Gordon D. Schaber County Courthouse and plaza designed by notable architecture firm Sasaki, Walker & Associates who designed notable works, including the Golden Gateway in San Francisco, the Del Mesa Carmel, in Carmel, CA, and the Fashion Island in Newport Beach, CA. The landscaping and plaza serve as a podium base for the entire courthouse complex and site. The landscaping for both plazas (East and West) is formal, minimalist and symmetrical, using simple geometric shapes (rectangles, squares, and circles) indicative of public plaza landscape architecture from this period.

The nominated resource has integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship and association. Integrity shall be judged with reference to the particular criterion or criteria specified in subsection A.1.a of this section (17.604.210.A.1.b)

The County Courthouse is in its original location. Its design features, including massing, pattern of fenestration, and relationship to the designed landscape are unaltered. The building is located within the County Center complex that contains a range of county services, and the county administrative services setting has not changed, retaining integrity of feeling and association as of the writing of this report. The building has undergone no apparent alterations to its exterior and no new materials have been introduced. Thus, it retains integrity of design, workmanship and materials.

The nominated resource has significant historic or architectural worth, and its designation as a landmark is reasonable, appropriate and necessary to promote, protect and further the goals and purposes of this chapter. (17.604.210.A.1.c)

The County Courthouse has significant historic and architectural worth as an example of the Mid-century Brutalist and New Formalism architectural styles. Its integrity of design, association, and feeling reflects its historic and continued function as an institutional building and is illustrative of the idea of “form follows function” a tenet of modernism, dictating that the architecture, particularly of public buildings, should be utilitarian and reflect the public-service use of the building.

The County Courthouse is owned by the State of California (State), and a local landmark designation under its current ownership is largely symbolic since the city cannot enforce any restrictions under City Code on other government entities such as the State of California. However, its designation as a landmark is still reasonable, appropriate and necessary to promote, protect and further the goals of the City, since the State ultimately plans to vacate the property. Should the building become excess state property, it may be transferred into private ownership in the future. Historic designation would ensure future development projects consider the building’s important historic features early in the design and programming process. Furthermore, designation would make a future private owner

eligible for certain tax incentives that could encourage adaptive reuse. For these reasons, the designation of this building is reasonable, appropriate and necessary to promote, protect and further the goals and purposes of the Historic Preservation Chapter of the City Code.

4701 Freeport Boulevard, Former Senator Savings and Loan Association / Chase Bank

Branch: The Chase Bank Branch meets the criteria for listing on the Sacramento register.

Specifically, the building satisfies the historical significance criteria for listing within City Code section 17.604.210.A.1.a.iii. Staff has concluded the resource retains sufficient historic integrity required for listing pursuant to City Code section 17.604.210.A.1.b. Finally, the nominated resource has significant architectural worth, and its designation as a landmark is reasonable, appropriate and necessary to promote, protect and further the goals and purposes of the Historic Preservation chapter of the City code, as required by section 17.604.210.A.1.c.

The building is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of the history of the city, the region, the state or the nation (17.604.210.A.1.a.i).

4701 Freeport Boulevard is significant under City Code section 17.604.210.A.1.a.i for its location and siting related to the expansion of savings and loan financial institutions with the expanding population, growing economy and development of suburban areas after WWII. The building site and architectural design included a circular, eye-catching structure, set back from the property line. This unique design is particularly important when it is compared to earlier central city financial institutions. These earlier banks were often built to property lines (e.g. 22nd & J St., O and 11th St.) and designed with permanence and prominence in mind. By incorporating a street-fronting landscaped area, with a dedicated on-site parking, 4701 Freeport provided easy car entry from Freeport Boulevard - features that responded to the suburban design setting in which it was developed, and which also served to distinguish it from the prior generation of built-to-property-line financial institutions.

The features of the property that contribute to its significance relative to this criteria include: its location and siting along the car-oriented commercial corridor being developed after WWII; its distinctive, relatively tall and circular form with drive-in to the site's parking area; its site design, with the structure set back from the property line, in its own setting surrounded by areas of plantings; and its exemplary manifestation of the Mid-Century Modern "new formalism" style among other notable Mid-Century Modern-era financial institutions built along this portion of Freeport Boulevard between Sutterville Road and 35th Avenue.

The building embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction (17.604.210.A.1.a.iii)

The former Senator Savings building is an important example of the New Formalism architectural style in Sacramento. New Formalism was a Mid-century Modern style from the 1960s to the 1970s. Constructed in 1964, this circular building represents distinctive elements of the architectural style, reflected in the building's overhanging roof slab, columns, the clay pattern, and windows. Additionally, the building expresses monumentality. The building also represents the work of Silvio Barovetto and

Albert Thomas of Barovetto & Thomas, who were known for Mid-century Modern designs in Sacramento until the death of Thomas in 1966. Interior details include cylindrical drop light fixtures, circular recessed lights that have larger radii radiating out from the center post, vertical tile wood paneling in the hall, and interior clay tile cladding.

The nominated resource has integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship and association. Integrity shall be judged with reference to the particular criterion or criteria specified in subsection A.1.a of this section (17.604.210.A.1.b)

The building remains in its original location. The overall design of the building is intact; additions which include a bank deposit box and light-fixture hood on the south side of the building blend with the overall design. The setting is intact: consistent with the time of construction in 1964, commercial development is concentrated on Freeport Boulevard and residential development is concentrated to the north, south, and east. Few non-historic materials have been introduced since the building was constructed, and those introduced do not detract from the overall material integrity evidenced by the natural clay tiles, sun screens, windows, and pre-cast concrete pillars. The bank building continues to express the aesthetic and historic sense of the mid-1960s, leaving intact the integrity of feeling and association.

The nominated resource has significant historic or architectural worth, and its designation as a landmark is reasonable, appropriate and necessary to promote, protect and further the goals and purposes of this chapter. (17.604.210.A.1.c)

The former Senator Savings building has significant historic and architectural worth as an example of New Formalist Mid-century Modern architecture of the work of the architectural firm Barovetto and Thomas. Designating this building as a landmark is reasonable, appropriate and necessary to promote, protect and further the goals of the City of Sacramento.

Financial Considerations: Not applicable.

Local Business Enterprise (LBE): Not applicable.